TOWN OF GREENBURGH PLANNING BOARD
1. ROLL CALL
5. ITEMS FOR PUBLIC HEARING/PUBLIC DISCUSSION PUBLIC DISCUSSION
FOBLIC DISCOSSION
a. CASE NO. PB 23-16
LITTLE DRAGON DAYCARE 130 Central Park Avenue North
(P.O. Hartsdale, N.Y.)
ADJOURNMENT.
x
Greenburgh Town Hall 177 Hillside Avenue
Greenburgh, New York 10607 September 20, 2023
HYBRID PLANNING BOARD MEETING
HIDKID FLANNING BOAKD MEETING
BARBARA MARCIANTE, Official Court Reporter

1	
2	
3	APPEARANCES:
4	
5	HUGH SCHWARTZ, CHAIRPERSON THOMAS HAY, VICE CHAIRPERSON
6	INOMAS NAI, VICE CHAIRFERSON
7	WALTER SIMON, Board Member(Virtual) KIRIT DESAI, Board Member
8	MICHAEL GOLDEN, Board Member LESLIE DAVIS, Board Member
9	JOHAN SNAGGS, Board Member
10	
11	AMANDA MAGANA, ESQ., Deputy Town Attorney(Not Present)
12	AARON SCHMIDT,
13	Deputy Commissioner of The Department of Community Development and Conservation
14	
15	MATTHEW BRITTON,
16	Town Planner, Department of Community Development and Conservation
17	<u> </u>
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Welcome to the Public
2	Hearing portion of our meeting this evening. Mr. Schmidt,
3	would you please call the roll?
4	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Sure. Chairperson
5	Schwartz?
6	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Here.
7	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Mr. Hay?
8	VICE CHAIRPERSON HAY: Here.
9	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Mr. Golden?
10	BOARD MEMBER GOLDEN: Here.
11	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Mr. Desai?
12	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: Here.
13	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Mr. Snaggs?
14	BOARD MEMBER SNAGGS: Here.
15	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Ms. Davis?
16	BOARD MEMBER DAVIS: Here.
17	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: And on Zoom,
18	Mr. Simon?
19	BOARD MEMBER SIMON: Here.
20	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay.
21	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: We're all set.
22	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Great. We're all here.
23	We have one case on this evening. It is Case PB 23-16. It
24	is a continuation of our meeting from the Public Hearing
25	from the last meeting, Little Dragon Day Care, 130 Central

Park Avenue North, P.O. Hartsdale. It's for a special permit for a child day care facility.

As you recall, this particular site is on the site of a church. And it was a nursery school for many, many years and it closed. And now they are proposing to reopen it as a day care center.

We had one issue that came up, which required, as I explained during the minutes, that requires to reopen the Public Hearing as we were about to close it, there is one piece of information from a gentleman who had actually leased six spaces on the property, which required the application to be revised for this evening.

As I understand it, Mr. Schmidt, it didn't create any new variances or anything like that; is that correct?

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: That is correct.

No additional variances and no need for a shared parking reduction.

CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay. So and I also understand it, the other issue was the nail care salon and I understand the nail salon has no lease.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: That's correct.

CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay. The other thing I do want to say upfront is that this is private property in terms of what can be required and what can't be, as I understand it from the law. Is that correct, Mr. Schmidt,

1	like crosswalks and things like that?
2	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Things of that
3	nature, right. It is a private property.
4	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay. And therefore, we
5	don't have jurisdiction. We can suggest
6	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Right.
7	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: we can suggest, but we
8	can't dictate
9	VICE CHAIRPERSON HAY: Require.
10	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Require any particular
11	style, for instance, of a crosswalk.
12	One final thing I want to say, and I said it
13	before, but I want to say it again. We are a volunteer
14	group that works up here. We try to get through the entire
15	agenda on a timely basis and move things on while still
16	maintaining our own lives besides that. And as such, we
17	want to keep focused on the project at hand only.
18	Unlike the Town Board, who has a period for
19	general comments and actually is a Legislative Board of the
20	Town, not us. We're just a ministerial Board. We
21	administer the law.
22	So public comments in our case are limited to the
23	specific project at hand. So I would appreciate that
24	anybody who is going to speak tonight to maintain that
25	rule.

Additionally, if you spoke at the last meeting, there is no need to repeat what you said at the last meeting. It became part of the public record, okay. And we can just move on from there and it was understood at the last meeting. I just want to make that clear, too.

And it's unfair not only to the applicant, you guys, but it's unfair to the public and the people waiting for additional meetings tonight. We have two fairly large projects after this meeting tonight. But also people just watching to stay focused on the Public Hearing.

Unless you have something specific that you need to say beyond what I did, I'm going to open it up for any questions from the Board.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Just quick?
CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Yes, go ahead.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: So I was only going to indicate that the applicant did go ahead and revise the plans. So there were two specific revisions made, to Plan Sheet One, which I have up on the screen now. And I'm scrolling. The note was added related to employee parking in the rear. There are spaces up in the back.

CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay.

DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: So beyond that.

And on Sheet Two, there is a revision made to identify that there is signage dedicated to the dentist parking on spaces

1	One through Six on the right-hand side of the screen. And
2	that spaces Seven through 16 are available for parent
3	dropoff and pickup.
4	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay, great.
5	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: That's it.
6	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Great. Thank you very
7	much. Any questions from Members of the Board?
8	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: Yes, I have a question.
9	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Go ahead, Kirit.
10	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: How do they access parking
11	to the employee parking?
12	MS. XINGLI CHENG: They can, I think there is
13	this is the owner so he can explain.
14	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Please give your name and
15	your position, please.
16	MR. EVERARD LLEWELLYN: Good evening. My name is
17	Everard Llewellyn. And I'm the Chairperson of the Board of
18	Trustees at St. Paul's United Baptist Church.
19	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Welcome.
20	MR. EVERARD LLEWELLYN: Thank you. I've been
21	there for 40 years. So I'm pretty familiar with this
22	property. Entrance on Central Avenue and then you drive
23	around the building and the parking is in the back. And
24	you can exit on Jane Street.
25	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: So again, I'm

1	showing the cursor. You come in Central
2	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Everybody exits on Jane
3	Street to go back out?
4	MR. EVERARD LLEWELLYN: Correct. If you don't
5	As long as you don't go around the building. If you go
6	around the building, your only exit is Jane Street. If you
7	remain on the Central Avenue side, you can enter and exit
8	on Central Avenue.
9	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay, thank you very much.
10	Appreciate that.
11	MR. EVERARD LLEWELLYN: Thank you.
12	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay, Kirit, anything
13	else?
14	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: The sign would be in the
15	beginning of the parking for the back or where the sign
16	would be for employee only?
17	VICE CHAIRPERSON HAY: I don't know if there is a
18	sign.
19	MR. EVERARD LLEWELLYN: There is no sign. That
20	will be indicated to them that they can go around the
21	building to park there.
22	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: So how do you prevent them
23	from parking in the front?
24	MS. XINGLI CHENG: Actually
25	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Just step up to the

1	mic. I'm sorry. Thank you. Go ahead.
2	MS. XINGLI CHENG: Yeah. And we're going to
3	clarify to our employees and those are the space for them
4	to park their car.
5	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Is it true you have
6	maximum six employees?
7	MS. XINGLI CHENG: Yes.
8	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay. So it's pretty
9	manageable. It's not like it's
10	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: That's true, yeah.
11	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay.
12	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: And then what is in the
13	rear? It's to be the whole floor is to be a day care and
14	you're using only half of it?
15	MS. XINGLI CHENG: Half.
16	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: Okay. So what is the other
17	half?
18	MS. XINGLI CHENG: The other half is, I think,
19	she operates, she's like a therapist for children as she
20	only
21	MR. EVERARD LLEWELLYN: Physical therapy.
22	MS. XINGLI CHENG: Yeah, physical therapy. She
23	operate after hours.
24	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: Okay.
25	MS. XINGLI CHENG: Yeah.

1	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: Thank you.
2	MS. XINGLI CHENG: You're welcome.
3	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Anybody else from the
4	Board? No?
5	(Whereupon, there was no response.)
6	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Anybody on Zoom tonight?
7	Are you sure?
8	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: Mr. Simon
9	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Walter? Walter, go ahead.
10	BOARD MEMBER SIMON: I would just like to follow
11	up with Kirit's suggestion about the employee parking.
12	It's a very simple, inexpensive cost to the applicant just
13	to put a sign up and say employee parking only or something
14	to that effect to designate that area as employee parking.
15	VICE CHAIRPERSON HAY: Well, the applicant
16	doesn't own the building. And it's not used just for this
17	purpose. So I don't know that it would be appropriate,
18	Walter, to put a sign there just for their business, which
19	only operates certain times of the week. You know, on
20	weekend it's the
21	BOARD MEMBER SIMON: Okay. Okay. Duly noted. I
22	withdraw my suggestion.
23	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay. Anything else,
24	Walter?
25	BOARD MEMBER SIMON: No, that's it.

1	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay. Anybody else on the
2	Board have anything to say?
3	(Whereupon, there was no response.)
4	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Anybody else on Zoom?
5	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: I don't believe
6	there is anyone else on Zoom. If there is, now would be
7	the time to request to speak. I'll stop the share screen.
8	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay. Anybody from the
9	public want to speak?
10	MR. MURRAY BODIN: Yes.
11	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Mr. Bodin. Anybody else?
12	Okay, Mr. Bodin. Please stick to the topic as I suggested.
13	Thank you.
14	MR. MURRAY BODIN: My name is Murray Bodin. And
15	what you just said is exactly what's wrong. You have no
16	right to tell me what to speak about. You've done it
17	before. You did it in an email today, which was entirely
18	improper. And I question
19	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: I emailed you about
20	MR. MURRAY BODIN: Wait a minute. I'm speaking.
21	When I finish, you can speak.
22	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: This will be the last time
23	you speak here if you continue this, okay. Do you want to
24	speak on the project or not? Yes or no?
25	MR. MURRAY BODIN: I am

1	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Do you want to speak on
2	this project or not?
3	MR. MURRAY BODIN: I am speaking on this project.
4	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Actually, you're not. Do
5	you want to speak on this project or not, Mr. Bodin?
6	MR. MURRAY BODIN: I am speaking
7	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Then speak on the project,
8	please. Limit your comments to the project.
9	MR. MURRAY BODIN: You have demonstrated this
10	evening that you've made changes to the site plan twice. I
11	recommend or I Considering the safety issue on East
12	Hartsdale Avenue, you show a crosswalk here that's not the
13	safest crosswalk to use.
14	The safest crosswalk to use is the bar crosswalk,
15	which is used in New York City, Connecticut, California and
16	probably in the rest of the world.
17	Greenburgh has been beside itself trying to make
18	East Hartsdale Avenue safer. I place a start to
19	acknowledge that the safest crosswalk and the only one that
20	looks the same to the driver is the parallel bar.
21	So I take this up I'm basing this on Maui
22	where they were notified of issues that were wrong and they
23	didn't replace it. And there have been any number of other
24	ones throughout the world in the last couple of weeks where

people were notified of issues that were not safe.

25

1	The crosswalk that you show on this is not the
2	safest crosswalk for a pedestrian. This is the start of
3	sensitizing this Board and other boards to use the safest
4	for pedestrians throughout the Town of Greenburgh.
5	I request that this not be approved until the
6	crosswalk is changed to a parallel bar crosswalk. I was
7	there today. I drove through it, in and out. Got to
8	made sure I understood what was going on. And when you
9	said you can go out one side if you didn't go around the
10	building, exactly correct. I wanted to make sure I saw
11	what you are talking about.
12	This is the start where Greenburgh needs to
13	understand that every crosswalk that comes before this
14	Board, this being a prime example, be the same.
15	BOARD MEMBER GOLDEN: Mr. Bodin, let me just
16	interrupt you one minute.
17	MR. MURRAY BODIN: Certainly.
18	BOARD MEMBER GOLDEN: Can we share Mr. Bodin's
19	suggestion with our expert and get his input
20	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: I think we already
21	did.
22	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: We already. He brought it
23	up at the last meeting. We already did.
24	BOARD MEMBER GOLDEN: What did he say?
25	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: What did he say, Aaron?

1	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: His thought was
2	that on highly traveled roadways, where there are
3	crosswalks for pedestrians, the parallel bar style is a
4	method that's recommended. That's what I was if you
5	look at any of the manuals, there are alternatives.
6	I know Mr. Bodin's position that the bar style is
7	the safest for pedestrians because the drivers pick up on
8	that style better than the other styles; correct me if I'm
9	wrong. But in terms of the manuals, which I believe your
10	position is that
11	MR. MURRAY BODIN: The position is First of
12	all, I was on a team that wrote that manual for the last 30
13	years. So I have experience in actually writing the words
14	that you are describing.
15	If there is a choice for the safest crosswalk,
16	why wouldn't you use it? Yes, there are options, but why
17	use an option that is less safe?
18	BOARD MEMBER GOLDEN: Why don't we hear what the
19	applicant says about changing the style of the crosswalk?
20	MR. MURRAY BODIN: It is not up to the applicant
21	to decide. The applicant is not qualified to describe
22	safety.
23	BOARD MEMBER GOLDEN: No. See if they
24	MR. MURRAY BODIN: The consultant
25	BOARD MEMBER SIMON: May I

1	BOARD MEMBER GOLDEN: They may not
2	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: I see you, Walter. Just
3	hold on. Finish, Michael.
4	BOARD MEMBER GOLDEN: They may not mind changing
5	it. It may be non-cost issue.
6	BOARD MEMBER SNAGGS: Can we be clear that the
7	applicant is a tenant in the space. So the conversation
8	needs to be had with the owner of the property.
9	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Yes. And we actually have
10	no jurisdiction to dictate this at all.
11	BOARD MEMBER SNAGGS: Okay.
12	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: But Walter, you had
13	something to say?
14	BOARD MEMBER SIMON: Okay. I think based upon
15	this, Mr. Bodin's statement, which appear to be confirmed
16	by Aaron, that on busy streets, that it works very well.
17	But we, as a Town, have not adopted that in our as our
18	requirement.
19	The question is, seeing how we know it works well
20	in heavy traffic areas
21	MR. MURRAY BODIN: Every traffic area.
22	BOARD MEMBER SIMON: what is the downside when
23	we have appropriate jurisdiction, not in this case because
24	the applicant is not an owner, but what is the downside
25	when we have appropriate jurisdiction to apply the

crosswalk, the cross slashes as Mr. Bodin recommends? 1 CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Walter, at this point, we 2 3 haven't seen the empirical data there in terms of not busy intersections or places. Our traffic consultant has said 4 5 it's good for busy places. I can see Mr. Bodin's logic that if it's good for 6 7 busy places, why shouldn't it be good for less busy places. 8 That logic makes some sense. 9 MR. MURRAY BODIN: Thank you. 10 CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: But I -- let me finish, 11 Mr. Bodin, okay. Because I'm actually agreeing with you, 12 okay. I am the Chair, okay. MR. MURRAY BODIN: Yeah, but I deserve the same 13 14 respect that you do. When I interrupt you, you don't like it. And when you interrupt me, I don't like it. 15 16 CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: I just want to finish my 17 statement. 18 MR. MURRAY BODIN: So I want to finish mine, too, 19 when I talk. 20 CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Thank you. Anyway, so I 21 think it's something we should probably ask the Town Board to look into and ask our traffic safety people and our 22 traffic consultants to look into. 23 However, it doesn't -- can't impact this. We 24 don't have the law in the books to do it. We have no 25

jurisdiction of it. The applicant isn't even, as Johan 1 pointed out, the owner of the property. Whether this is a 2 good idea or not, it very well may be a good idea, okay. 3 Mr. Bodin has done a great job in helping us with 4 5 crosswalks on a couple different properties than this. But we just don't have jurisdiction here. 6 MR. MURRAY BODIN: I would like to make a 7 8 comment. 9 CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Yes, sir. MR. MURRAY BODIN: There is no difference between 10 11 a busy street and a smaller street. A crosswalk should 12 look the same anywhere. 13 CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay, go ahead. 14 listening. Go ahead. MR. MURRAY BODIN: To distinguish between a busy 15 16 street and what's not so busy is just not logical. 17 should look the same where ever you go on every single 18 crosswalk; whether it's in a parking lot or on a street, in 19 a city or a state. It's time that we put pedestrians 20 safety front and center. 21 CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: I understand your point. 22 Thank you very much. Anything else you would like to say 2.3 about this project? 24 MR. MURRAY BODIN: Yeah. Because the way you

treated me, I wonder whether or not it's time for you to

25

1	retire and let somebody younger who's more flexible to take
2	over
3	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Thank you very much
4	MR. MURRAY BODIN: I have a right to speak
5	VICE CHAIRPERSON HAY: That's not part of this
6	application.
7	MR. MURRAY BODIN: I have a right
8	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Thank you very much,
9	Mr. Bodin.
10	MR. MURRAY BODIN: I think it's time that you
11	retire and let somebody else who is more flexible to take
12	over this meeting.
13	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: I'm quiet flexible. Thank
14	you, Mr. Bodin. Okay, anybody else want to speak on this
15	project?
16	(Whereupon, there was no response.)
17	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay. I asked if there
18	had been anybody on Zoom? Is there anybody on Zoom?
19	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: There is not.
20	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay, good. I'll take a
21	motion to close the Public Hearing?
22	BOARD MEMBER SNAGGS: So moved.
23	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: And leave the record open
24	until
25	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: So there is a

1	couple of options.
2	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Right.
3	DEPUTY COMMISSIONER SCHMIDT: One, the Board
4	indicated at the last meeting, if all the issues were
5	addressed, the Board may wish to consider a decision this
6	evening being that its received public comment another time
7	and this evening.
8	Staff did prepare a Draft Decision for the
9	Board's consideration. It's completely up to the Board if
10	it wishes to move forward with a decision this evening.
11	Or, you can close the record, leave the written record open
12	for one week and we can do it two weeks from now.
13	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: How does the Board feel
14	about that?
15	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: I think we should consider
16	what Aaron suggestion is. So I agree with Aaron.
17	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: To close it tonight and
18	also vote tonight? That's what you're saying, Kirit?
19	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: Yes.
20	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Leslie?
21	BOARD MEMBER DAVIS: Yes, I agree.
22	VICE CHAIRPERSON HAY: I agree.
23	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Tom, you agree. I agree.
24	BOARD MEMBER GOLDEN: Same.
25	BOARD MEMBER SNAGGS: Agree.

1	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Everybody?
2	BOARD MEMBER SIMON: I agree.
3	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay. So I'll take a
4	motion to close the Public Hearing and go back into Work
5	Session to vote on a decision on this project this evening.
6	BOARD MEMBER SNAGGS: So moved.
7	VICE CHAIRPERSON HAY: Second.
8	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Johan and Tom. All in
9	favor? Aye.
10	VICE CHAIRPERSON HAY: Aye.
11	BOARD MEMBER GOLDEN: Aye.
12	BOARD MEMBER SNAGGS: Aye.
13	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: Aye.
14	BOARD MEMBER DAVIS: Aye.
15	BOARD MEMBER SIMON: Aye.
16	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Opposed?
17	(Whereupon, there was no response.)
18	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Abstentions?
19	(Whereupon, there was no response.)
20	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Now, I'll take a motion to
21	close the Public Hearing portion of tonight's meeting.
22	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: So moved.
23	BOARD MEMBER SNAGGS: Second.
24	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Second
25	BOARD MEMBER SIMON: Second.

1	VICE CHAIRPERSON HAY: No, Johan second.
2	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Johan second. All in
3	favor? Aye.
4	VICE CHAIRPERSON HAY: Aye.
5	BOARD MEMBER GOLDEN: Aye.
6	BOARD MEMBER DESAI: Aye.
7	BOARD MEMBER SNAGGS: Aye.
8	BOARD MEMBER SIMON: Aye.
9	BOARD MEMBER DAVIS: Aye.
10	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: All opposed?
11	(Whereupon, there was no response.)
12	CHAIRPERSON SCHWARTZ: Okay. Thank you.
13	(Whereupon, the Public Hearing was concluded.)
14	* * * * * * * * *
15	
16	CERTIFICATION
17	
18	Certified to be a true and accurate
19	transcript of the Public Hearing of the Greenburgh Planning
20	Board Meeting proceedings held on September 20, 2023, taken by
21	the undersigned, to the best of her ability.
22	
23	Barbara Marciante
24	Barbara Marciante,
25	Official Court Reporter